

18-447: Computer Architecture Guidelines on Paper Reviews

Prof. Onur Mutlu
Carnegie Mellon University
Spring 2015

How to Do the Paper/Talk Reviews

- 1: Brief summary
 - What is the problem the paper is trying to solve?
 - What are the key ideas of the paper? Key insights?
 - What is the key contribution to literature at the time it was written?
 - What are the most important things you take out from it?
- 2: Strengths (most important ones)
 - Does the paper solve the problem well?
- 3: Weaknesses (most important ones)
 - This is where you should **think critically**. Every paper/idea has a weakness. This does not mean the paper is necessarily bad. It means there is room for improvement and future research can accomplish this.
- 4: Can you do (much) better? Present your thoughts/ideas.
- 5: What have you learned/enjoyed/disliked in the paper? Why?

- Review should be short and concise (~half a page or shorter)

Advice on Paper/Talk Reviews

- When doing the reviews, be very critical
- Always think about better ways of solving the problem or related problems